



SELLING THE BACKSTAGE

Heritage and enterprise in community-based tourism: the case of
Kyrgyzstan

Johanna Stenersen



Kyrgyzstan is a small mountainous country in Central Asia, it is undergoing a political and economic transitional phase. Since independence 1991, Kyrgyzstan has been struggling with economic difficulties, political instability and internal ethnic conflicts. How to unite its people around a national identity constitutes another great challenge.

INTRO

Tourism connotes adventure, leisure and pleasure. In addition, it is the fastest growing industry in the world and the sector that many of the poorest countries in the world rank as their first, second or third most important industry. Further it is the only service industry to show a positive balance of trade with flow from first world countries to developing countries (WTO, 2005). Global tourism is certainly not a holiday affaire; it is a considerable force, that touches most sectors in society. Tourism simultaneously represents everyday life, a political instrument and a social change factor. It is also a means for nations and regions to create an improved and globally recognized image (cf Dallen 20001; Hall 2004; Sharpley and Telfer 2002 et al.). This article draws on a study of Community Based Tourism (CBT) in Kyrgyzstan in June-July, 2005. The study used an anthropological approach based on participatory observation and 14 in-depth interviews with administrative staff and local CBT members from the local CBT groups in Kohkor and Bokonbaevo (two villages in Naryn region). The study examines the liaison between enterprise and heritage in the creation of Community Based Tourism as a tourist destination and a tourist narrative. I have wanted to understand these mechanisms in a context of development and socio-cultural transition. How do members relate to the tourism enterprise and what is their perception of development? What are they experiences from tourism and how are CBT destinations represented and how do members feel about this image? What are their views on what the tourism venture should contain and how do they live the experience? In the course of socio-political transitional processes, history is being rewritten and new official versions it occur. Tourism transcends economic, political and

ISSUE 6
December 2006

symbolic borders and is a powerful tool in creating new narratives, as places become tourist destinations, mythical and real.

THE KYRGYZ CONTEXT

During most of the 1990s, Kyrgyzstan was considered the 'good example' of Central Asia and seemed to move rather quickly in the direction anticipated by the international community: President Akayev prompted economic reforms by adopting market principles and political stability through democratisation. But he also pursued a nationalistic agenda in putting forward a process of *Kyrgyzification* of the state, which was considered offensive by other ethnic groups (Schofield 2004:116). Akayev's government made a number of significant reforms, such as making the Kyrgyz language the official one and promoting Kyrgyz traditions and cultural historical heritage. Pretty quickly, tourism became the government's focal point, inasmuch it offers economic growth and effectively contributes to the creation and strengthening of the political and cultural imaginary of Kyrgyzstan, both internally and externally. The year 2001 was appointed the 'Year of Tourism' (*God Turista*), and considerable efforts were made to promote tourism as the way forward. In 2003, a nationwide publicity campaign was launched with the slogan "Kyrgyzstan, our shared home" ^[1], depicting Akayev as the country's father. In March 2005 years of criticism amounted to a small revolution and Akayev's rule ended. The presidential elections held in July 2005 were won by Kurmanbek Bakiyev.

Kyrgyzstan is now gaining some notoriety among a Western audience thanks to its mountain peaks, botanical variety and 'untouched' nature and culture.



Shepherd's life: road sign. Picturesque or underdeveloped? Photo by Johanna Stenersen.

THE KYRGYZ CONCEPT

Community Based Tourism Support Project (CBTSP) was initiated in Kyrgyzstan by the Swiss non-governmental organization Helvetas. 'Community-based' means that support is given to products, services, knowledge and practices found in local communities and offered by local service providers. The notion of 'community-based' is part of the drive in development policies from the mid 90s and is in itself a good brand, almost moral (see Butcher 2003): it connotes sustainability and is often connected to eco- and cultural tourism, as opposed to mainstream tourism.

Community Based Tourism (CBT) is a membership organisation, which in 2005 was divided into 11 local groups throughout the country, including a little more than 300 family enterprises. In the village of Kochkor, with some 4,000 inhabitants, where did based half of my study, an estimated 300 people are engaged in CBT activities, while the actual number of member organisations is 33. Potential profit is indeed a key motivation for engagement. For many members, international tourism represents a window to 'the world' - mainly the Western hemisphere. Commitment to CBT thus provides them with a sense of belonging to the Western value package, as well as to a supposedly globally interlinked business.

TRADITION IN LATE MODERNITY

To develop the tourist sector has increasingly become a means of action for countries and regions to "seek to project a particular self-image to the wider community" (Light, 2001). In CBT, activities circle around Kyrgyz traditions and customs, with constant references to the ancient origins of the Kyrgyz people. The following quotation is taken from an information leaflet presented by the CBT group in the village of Kochkor.

"More than 95% ethnically Kyrgyz, Kochkor's hospitable people engage in agriculture and traditional Kyrgyz crafts. Stay in traditional Kyrgyz style. Experience our age-old way of life, where women look after the hearth, where children listen to their parents, where old men enjoy honour and respect. Sleep on hand-made felt carpets called *shyrdaks* (Kochkor's are among Kyrgyzstan's finest) and enjoy a breakfast cooked with fresh, local products. Bake your own bread, eat traditional Kyrgyz dishes and make *kymyz*, the national drink of fermented mare's milk. Weave your own *ala-kiyiz* or wall hanging with expert assistance from the local women – not only an unforgettable experience, but also a lasting souvenir. Our folklore group performs Kyrgyz national songs and dances accompanied by the *komuz*, *choor* and other Kyrgyz musical instruments. In the local museum see examples of Kochkor's flora and fauna, hear our oldest legends and learn the history of this land".

The text above regards culture as tradition, something ancient, and thus most likely to be found in areas where it has been conserved. It further depicts Kyrgyz culture as “conservative”, having resisted the influence of other cultures, which made it possible to preserve both culture and landscape. Ancient knowledge and wisdom sort to come along – to be old and ‘anti-modern’ is a warrant of authenticity. “Traditions of a nomadic life have been preserved” and greet the visitors, as if the traditions have been left as untouched as the landscape, a living reminiscence of the past. The capital Bishkek has different qualities, “a hotbed of new business and organisations”, “progressive and forward-looking”.

In CBT, ethnicity and cultural pluralism are boasted, presenting the cultural and ethnical variety as a rather colourful plate from which visitors can choose, such as the idea of traditional life provoked by images of *yurtas*, mare-milking women in traditional outfits, shepherds with sticks in hand and colourful handicraft. Most of the CBT-members I interviewed perceived the very essence of traditions as the *good values* that appear to be missing in contemporary life or in Western culture. The most frequent words used by interviewees as well as in tourist brochures to describe essence of the Kyrgyz culture were hospitality, trust and loyalty. These also happen to be virtues that are often considered lacking in modern society.

RE-MAPPING THE PAST

There are no references whatsoever to the Soviet heritage on the CBT's official website ^[2]. This fact stands in contrast to the obvious presence of Soviet heritage in villages and people's lives. The tourism narrative that is created by means of marketing etc accentuates ancient features of the culture, which was sometimes resented by my interviewees, who wanted to develop a professional, entrepreneurial business identity instead. Marketing strategies confirm stereotypes when inviting (Western) tourists to come and enjoy a kind of culture they no longer possess (as described by Viken 1998 and Selwyn 1996). Many interviewees witnessed of how their numerous encounters with travellers from other parts of the world blend with an increasing awareness of their own cultural history. The tourism discourse contributes to establishing a historical notion that excludes the socialist/communist heritage. Between the Soviet past and a post-socialist future lies a quite unidentified state of transition. There were different opinions among the interviewees on whether or not Soviet heritage sites should figure on materials such as maps, brochures, etc. “Entire cities and regions, decades and cultures have become aware of themselves as tourist attractions” (MacCannell 1972/2002: 16) and must therefore take political decisions. This consciousness also spurs the national and ethnic awareness and inspires a sense of belonging, but also of differentiation.

Thus, the narrative puts strong emphasis on the exotic and ancient features of CBT destinations and the locals. What characters hide behind the stereotypes, and what different approaches to tourism and tradition do the members have? The following sections will describe four different modes of characters in CBT, with varying prerequisites and prospects.

THE TRADITIONAL WITHOUT CHOICE

Some CBT-members are very poor people with extremely limited possibilities of influencing their own situations. This mode, the traditional without choice can be embodied in the following example.

The young daughter in law of a CBT member, for instance, came to live with the family through an early, arranged marriage. She now has a small child and lives with her father in law, a brother in law and her child in the summer pastures from May to September. Her husband is working and living elsewhere. Most of the chores in the *yurta* traditionally belong to the women's sphere, especially the younger ones: milking the mares, cooking, collecting firewood and making fire, preparing *kymyz* and cream, washing, caring for the children and serving the other members of the household, as well as tending to tourists.

Men are in charge of the cattle and work as guides and drivers, and therefore are more visible in the landscape and more often seen with tourists. The tourism narrative portrays the 'local' as traditional, untouched, natural and backwards. In development discourse, the image until quite recently has been quite similar, where developing subjects are seen as poor and passive (Pieterse 2001). How will CBT improve the lives of very poor families, and in particular of the young woman in the example, and her future daughters? For her there is no domain other than the domestic and certainly no other domains of influence. She has basic schooling, does not work outside the household and is not allowed to pursue her own interests.

Ideally, the traditional without choice in many ways is the perfect representative of Kyrgyz culture in a cultural tourism context – genuine, authentic and unaware. The tourist is facing a local with real conditions in an – almost – real situation. In the example from above, the woman is real, her chores are real and so are her poverty and relatively powerless situation in society. In terms of power, she is the most vulnerable one, with the least influence over business as well as over her own life. In economic terms, this category of members would benefit the most from CBT activities. There is also the question of to what extent tourism business is

able, not only improve life conditions, but also empower this woman. However, this is at the same time a group that tourism is likely to have a huge potential impact on. Issues of what is preserved, what is developed, and what should and should not, naturally arise in a discussion of this kind. "The very idea of a national 'inheritance' and its relation to widespread perceptions of both past and continuing inequalities" (Corner and Harvey, 1991: 47) is certainly something that should be taken seriously.

THE TRADITIONAL BY CHOICE

The above discussion about choices and changes is vital to the development of social capital. The motivation for people to engage in tourism ventures is to increase their life choices, but some CBT-members were determined to pursue a traditional way of life and saw CBT as a means to do so. It allowed them to practise traditions both in the private and the professional spheres of life, although many still had other occupations outside the tourism venture. Employees of the former Soviet administration were still working in the public administration and as a matter of fact quite a few of them were also involved with the CBT. This leap from communist to capitalist structures, from uniform Soviet citizen to overt ethnic identity appeared to be less dramatic for them than one might have expected.

This shows how vigilantly individuals handle and negotiate a bundle of identities: professional, cultural, social, family, national, etc. The way of life has taken a turn in favour of the Kyrgyz lifestyle and today members representing the traditional with choice can be said to embody a somewhat hybrid cultural position between the Soviet modern and the post-socialist traditional. Not necessarily do people choose between cultures of ideologies, but perform a mix that is true to them. For some of the people I met, the turn to tradition and culture was natural, although not necessarily anticipated or fought for. One CBT member explained how the Soviet and Kyrgyz aspects of her identity had always been side by side, but depending on the situation, one or the other would be expressed more. She saw the opportunity to use her professional skills in CBT as beneficial both for the organisation and for the individual. One possible consequence though is that former power structures are transplanted into the new era and that CBT will reproduce existing communitarian power relations.

This is the mode in which Soviet heritage is most prevailing, at least in terms of intellectual or professional capital. Compared to the previous mode, there is a substantial difference in terms of social capital and education. There is also an expressed wish to improve conditions in the community, a sense of collective responsibility that those members who are struggling to make ends meet obviously cannot afford to demonstrate,

the latter being too preoccupied by their own situation to engage actively in that of other people. In addition, this mode dwells in an awareness of how far the traditional 'territory' stretches and an ambition to let children move beyond its borders, while trusting that they will later somehow 'return to tradition'. The household with its hierarchy clearly represents traditional space, while profession and business represent a more contemporary one. Members within this mode regard culture and customs as 'natural' and authentic, and those who exploit them are met with scepticism.

When looking at cultural identity, it is necessary to consider the class perspective. Former Soviet civil servants were very clear about what was appropriate cultural behaviour. 'Uncivil' customs, such as bride kidnapping, are evidently not practiced or tolerated. Ideas about hygiene and sanitation are prioritised. There is also a pride in personal achievements and the family history, and no contradiction in having a huge portrait of a family member in the Red Army uniform, a classy collection of Soviet china and *yurta* (Kyrgyz traditional felt tent) in the garden. To take away the Soviet heritage would reduce the status that came with it, a legacy still recognized. A medal of honor from the Red Army still means the owner is a hero, and Soviet china communicates wealth, class and position.

THE MODERN NOSTALGIC LOOKING BACK

Many people expressed a wish to reconnect to the Kyrgyz traditions and history. One interviewee expressed how she experienced staying in the family's *yurta* as follows:

"It's so beautiful and peaceful. The calm and greatness, it's unbelievable. We too are like guests, newcomers. I know this place very well, but since we started coming here every year. For us this is also exotic".

One important difference between this mode and the one above is not only the newly awakened interest in Kyrgyz culture, but also the willingness to explore it literally, by taking music lessons in traditional Kyrgyz instruments, buying traditional costumes, attending workshops in handicraft and the like. There is a stronger wish to reconnect to a culture conceived as somewhat alienated from contemporary life and to make concrete private connections. The reflective process of cultural discovery and recovery is particularly present among these interviewees, who are, in many respects, tourists themselves. They have no cattle and consider their tourism business as partly vacation, partly business. For this group has other main sources of income and in a better position to appreciate the calm and the beauty and reflect upon their experiences in CBT. The

(re)discovery of tradition and living the 'exotic' seem to be part of an individual process and the feelings of the informant seem to fit the description of the modern (mostly Western) tourists who wish to travel 'into the past' (Viken 1998:37) when visiting other cultures that are (believed to be) pre-modern. Traditional values are rediscovered and cherished, although not necessarily practised. This mode lies in the very intersection between a modern and traditional lifestyle. There are choices, in terms of both past and future. Tradition is more of a value base than solid structure.

The ability to negotiate one's own identity, or a community's identity, is a necessary asset. I was positively surprised by the variety I encountered among the CBT-members I interviewed. People always seemed to stress the common ground over the differences. There was a very strong notion of "our culture" and "our heritage", ironically – but perhaps not surprisingly – more articulated by those who did not lead a traditional way of life. In the interviews, it became clear that to this mode, there is no conflict between a traditional Kyrgyz identity and a modernised version. They are equally 'true'.

Through the process of nationalisation, these different aspects in contemporary Kyrgyz identity are now to be moulded together furnished with a common past and shared framework, which means to agree on what will be included and what will be left out (see Graburn 2001: 213).

THE MODERN ENTREPRENEUR LOOKING FORWARD

In the global tourism paradigm, now supported by the international community, tourism is conceived as *the* enterprise. It is a space both real and invented, and in this intersection, a giant service sector is created to stimulate tourists to spend money and leisure time in order to fulfil our dreams. Tourism is also increasingly the interface in which places – nations, regions, cities, etc. – are branded as destinations and achieve or aspire a position on a map. The tour operator, the government, the entrepreneurial individual are agents of change and branding and constantly on the lookout for tourist activities to explore. As opposed to the previous mode, the motifs for engaging in CBT are more business oriented.

National history and cultural identity are regarded as having business potential and heritage is consequently 'remoulded' to fit expectations and demands. Cultural ceremonies are one example of how heritage can be commodified, especially those considered highly authentic and intimate, like wedding and baptism rituals. Traditional games are being promoted through marketing efforts – and far easier to organise. There is an

understanding among the people in the communities of the exclusiveness and attraction of these ceremonies and those members who showed a more entrepreneurial spirit were not foreign to turning the former into tourist events. However, they had to be 'for real' (compare Boorstin's 1992 discussion on pseudo-events); people would actually be marrying, not just pretending. The guest would be financing the event to a certain extent.

This mode embraces heritage as enterprise, and expresses a certain distance towards traditions. The economic value of the cultural commodity is at its core, and some of the interviewees proved ready to move beyond souvenirs and public festivals into the realm of intimate cultural utterances. Looking forward does not mean forgetting about past, but engaging in it with a stronger sense of detachment from cultural practices. Rationalisation - "the process where traditional customs give way to contemporary ways" (Wang 2000: 15)- rules.

A NEW PAST FOR A NEW FUTURE

In Kyrgyzstan, culture is currently coming alive again, both in actual and in symbolic terms. The almost absolute absence in CBT^[3] of references to a Soviet past or heritage, still widely present in the country, somehow helps reinforce an ethnic historic continuity. In fact, an entire series of Soviet heritage that might also be termed as 'a modernity heritage' -such as political, educational or cultural reminders and remainders- is considered universal and taken for granted, instead of accounted for as soviet heritage. The public space – street names, monuments etc – is converted from Soviet to Kyrgyz. The Soviet infrastructure and its symbolic structure are being museumized and locked away (see Walsh 1992). Many objects -monuments, statues and street signs- are still found in the streets, markets and antique stores, where the most exquisite examples of Soviet heritage find buyers. However, even though the historic importance might be denied in the rhetoric, we must not forget that people have strong personal or family connections to that recent past. To deny it entirely would be like denying one's family.

This became clear for me when I was guided through the collections of a village museum. Members were playing up their 'Kyrgyzness' and pretended that every object was truly ancient. However, when we reached the Soviet heritage section, there was a shift in atmosphere. The walls featured people from the village, war heroes and Soviet heroes awarded for good work. We walked solemnly among the portraits and I was told many stories of different people and their relatives' deeds that they were intimately proud of.

TOURISM AS NATIONAL NARRATIVE AND PRACTICE

Through CBT, its members also contribute to increase the local influence

over the “texture of memory” and its “iconographic, architectonic and textual organisation” (Young, 1988: 173). Tourism as narrative and practice is enforcing the importance of *solid memory* : of sites and sights - both naturally spectacular and manmade monuments- around which to organise a collective memory.

It is difficult to judge what to attribute to the national transition or to the rise in tourism, and not so relevant here. The creation of such a collective memory and history is taking place and CBT has become vital in constructing this texture of memory. In fact, CBT itself is being encapsulated in this texture. Within and around the context of CBT, a novel constellation of symbols and practices –old and new– is taking form. Some are new to Kyrgyz tourism, such as home-stays, handicraft workshops, etc., and point to a new ideological orientation towards individual performance and benefits.

SELLING THE BACKSTAGE

The fact that traditions and cultural practices are more likely to be found in rural areas, which are considered more conservative, may also affect the rural-urban power symmetry. Rural, conservative areas are often perceived as being in the periphery of social, political, economical and/or cultural development, and the peripheral epicentre of tradition and authenticity is thus to be found in these locations. That is where the roots and historical connections are now sought for in order to be ‘connected’ to the ‘modern’ centres in contemporary Kyrgyzstan. This is also how tradition is literally integrated in the national economy. In Kyrgyzstan, the making of felt articles is big business. Felt is used to make hats, shoes, clothes and seat covers, and most importantly in the fabrication of yurts. In Bishkek, the same articles and items can be found, but in fancier shops and with considerably higher prices. Among a certain genre of tourists, it is understood that a purchase closer to the place of production or on location adds to the object’s value, as if the authenticity of the actual location transcended the object. This ‘estimation’ is beneficial for local producers and fast-spreading news. It also contributes to raising the local communities’ self-esteem against the dominant urban industry.

The handicraft industry is an example of how development, preservation, enterprise and heritage are mutually dependant in the Kyrgyz CBT context. One goal is to increase the amount of people involved in the business that can make an income from it. Another goal is to get more women involved in the business (with an eye towards gender equality). A third goal is to promote the country’s heritage and tradition, which in turn might attract more local people to learn handicrafts, which could attract more visitors and thus add to the ‘cultural added value’ (c.f. Cohen 1977, Dicks 2003).

The twofold value of the tourist experience –economic and cultural– raises issues regarding the cultural and economic transactions. Sites of heritage are being increasingly capitalised and turned into sights, and subsequently spaces of translation. Flows of influence surround the heritage sites and imaginary spaces, which become places of cultural and social interaction. To the more entrepreneurial oriented members, the very action of enterprise renders sites and practices an added cultural value, with a price they become increasingly aware of.

SOCIAL CHANGE: A CAPITAL ISSUE

Not only values are transmitted, but also practices of community action. This gives members an opportunity to represent a political force without actually entering the political scene. The CBT community is a network that surpasses previous links between people, allowing its members to be part of a national association provided with a global showcase. Meetings and encounters with tourists are also part of developing a social structure and enhancing the members' *social capital*, in structural and cognitive terms (compare with Roberts 2004:54, see also Jones 2005).

Several references were made to the impact CBT has had in terms of group identity, capacity building and development of a structure in and between communities. There is even a substantive, *Cibititjni*, which refers to someone or something as CBT, and members talk about other CBT members as *nashi* (ours). CBT activities contribute to increased social capital and thus to social change. Particularly, the coordinators, often service-providers themselves, emphasised the influence that the tourism venture has on peoples' mind, behaviour and imagination. However, most members meant that the tourism business per se contributes to development and were not interested in contributing to further community development and engage in for example school building or road projects.

“It makes people open up. Not only to strangers, but also to neighbours and other people in the village. They are more cultivated, educated now... This has changed my views of things, for example, I didn't think about why things were a certain way, didn't know how things could be different...I have definitely become more knowing, know much more about everything around” (Katerina, 28).

To be 'cultivated' (kulturnye) and 'educated' (vosпитанные) represents an improvement and a social development.

CBT is introducing capitalistic proliferation among communities on the one hand and a more 'responsible' ideology of sustainability on the other. These values are at the core of CBT ethics and activities, and obviously have a strong symbolic and practical significance. Roughly said, CBT teaches people to be self-made, take community action in their own hands and preserve by means of enterprise. *Enterprise* as a notion and ideal has moved into the realm of development not only as an agent for change, but also as an agent for conservation.

Economic growth has been regarded as the motor of development. The discussion on development as the accumulation of various kinds of capitals makes clear to what extent financial and resource capital still hold a grip on ideas regarding what should be the means and ends of development. Even though social and human capital are widely recognized (Roberts, 2004: 54), they tend to be treated as elements in an economic equation of which the outcome is the only important thing.

LOCAL ACTION AND GLOBAL CONSEQUENCES (AND VICE VERSA)

CBT-members wished for a better life and better opportunities for themselves and their families.

Participatory approaches rest on principles of local commitment and change driven from within the community. The notion of empowerment is most frequently used to describe ways for minorities and other vulnerable groups in society to -if not increase their actual power- at least make them appear or feel powerful. However, empowerment is hard to measure both on an individual and on a structural level, posing questions regarding how these denominations transcend into social and political dynamics. Social capital is rarely recognised until change has occurred. Acquired new skills leading to initiatives and unforeseen change are often perceived as indication of increased social capital.

In my study, those who emphasised the benefits of social capital most (in terms of skills leading to mobilisation and action) were the ones in a position to choose. Many of the interviewees expressed that they had gained valuable new knowledge and that the tourism business was a good thing for them individually and for the greater society, not least due to its moral influence. In CBT, as in rural Kyrgyzstan, many things are lacking in terms of infrastructure, social and educational institutions. People feel inadequate and locally engineered initiatives are insufficient. Local forces and ambitions must be linked with objectives on a broader structural level.

A possible risk is that people could come up with ideas for projects that might not be beneficial for parts of the community, such as exploiting natural and cultural resources. Service providers represent a much bigger cause than themselves: involvement in CBT is a family business on the one hand, but on the other families are representing their national culture, while in several respects still building it. Ideas and interests might differ and knowledge and education on issues such as sustainability might be inadequate, the focus being to improve business, marketing and service rather than sustainable development. Communitarian participation is a “widely accepted criterion of sustainable tourism” (Hall and Richards 2000/2002: 49), but locally dispersed economic benefit does not by virtue entail adequate distribution.

In a development discourse, certain dichotomies –poor and rich, rural and urban, etc.– are being constantly emphasized. Within a tourism discourse, they risk being romanticized.

My study unveiled the variety that hides behind the homogenising rhetoric existing within the developmental tourism discourse. Real people and politics are very much a part of the tourist imaginary that curious and compassionate travellers set out to explore. Community Based Tourism turns both into a brand and into a format that is being refined and exported, and will as such become a considerable element in the tourism market, at least in symbolic terms.

The biggest players in the industry will of course remain where the money is, but we cannot dismiss the smaller participants’ experiences of loss and profit, growth or decline. Future studies should further investigate the delicate issue of sustainability and social change and analyse how the two concepts constantly rotate around each other. At the heart of this matter lie the economics of heritage and the socio-political, ideological and economic aspects of enterprise that create conditions for change and preservation, for better and for worse.

[1] “Kyrgyzstan, nasj obszji dom.” Campaign observed during journey to Kyrgyzstan in summer 2003.

[2] www.cbt.kg

[3] References to two monuments, one connected to the Martyrs of the Revolution and the other to the Great Patriotic War (WWII), can be found under the section Monuments on CBT’s official web page.

Johanna Stenersen is a consultant at *Plateau Communication*, a consultancy business specialized in development communication. A lecturer and supervisor at the department of Media and Communication in Karlstad University, she has worked with communication and advocacy in both the private and public sector. This article is based on her Master thesis in Communication for Development (Malmö University, May 2006). jstenersen@kau.se

- AlSayyad, Nezar (ed) (2001) *Consuming Tradition, Manufacturing Heritage. Global Norms and Urban Forms in the Age of Tourism*. London: Routledge.
- Boorstin, Daniel J. (1992) *The Image: A Guide to Pseudo-Events in America*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Butcher, J. (2003) *The Moralisation of Tourism: Sun, Sand...and Saving the World?* London: Routledge.
- CBT yearly report 2004.
- Cohen, Colleen Ballerino (1995) "Marketing Paradise, Marketing Nation", *Annals of Tourism Research*, Vol. 22, No 2:, pp. 404-21.
- Corner, John and Silvia Harvey (1991) *Enterprise and Heritage*. New York: Routledge.
- Dallen, J. Timothy (2001) *Tourism and Political Boundaries*. London: Routledge.
- Dallen J. Timothy and Stephen W. Boyd (2003) *Heritage Tourism*. London: Prentice Hall.
- Dicks, Bella (2003) *Culture on Display. The Production of Contemporary Visitability*. Maidenhead: Open University Press.
- Graburn, Nelson (2001) "What is Heritage and when is it Traditional?" in Nezar AlSayyad (ed) *Consuming Tradition, Manufacturing Heritage. Global Norms and Urban Forms in the Age of Tourism*. London: Routledge.
- Hall, Derek and Greg Richardson (eds) (2000/2002) *Tourism and Sustainable Community Development*. London: Routledge.
- Hall, Derek (ed.) (2004) *Tourism and Transition. Government, Development and Economy*. Wallingford: CABI Publishing.
- Hall, Michael and Hazel Tucker (2004) *Tourism and Postcolonialism. Contested discourses, identities and representations*. London: Routledge.
- Jones, Samantha (2004) "Community-Based Ecotourism. The Significance of Social Capital". *Annals of Tourism Research*, Vol. 32, No 2 pp. 303-324.
- Johnston, E. Margaret: Twynam, G.David and Haider, Wolfgang (1998) *Shaping tomorrow's north: the role of tourism and recreation*. Thunder Bay: Lakehead University.
- Light, Duncan (2001) "'Facing the future': tourism and identity-building in post-socialist Romania", *Political Geography*, 20:1053-1074.
- MacCannell, Dean (1976/99) *The Tourist. A New Theory of the Leisure Class*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Mowforth, Martin and Ian Munt (1998/2003) *Tourism and sustainability. Development and new tourism in the third world. (second edition)*. London: Routledge.
- Perkins, Harvey C and David C Thorns (2001) "Gazing or Performing? Reflections on Urry's Tourist Gaze in the Context of Contemporary Experience in the Antipodes", *International Sociology*, Vol 16, No 2: 185-204.
- Pieterse, Jan Nederven (2001) *Development Theories. Deconstructions and Reconstructions*.
- Pilgrim, John and S. Wahab (1997) *Tourism Development and Growth: the Challenge of Sustainability*. London: Routledge.
- Roberts, Lesley (2004) *Capital Accumulation in Derek Hall (ed.) Tourism and Transition. Government, Development and Economy*. Wallingford: CABI Publishing.
- Schofield, Peter (2004) "Positioning the Tourism Product of an Emerging Industry: Image, Resources and Politics in Kyrgyzstan" in Derek Hall (ed.) *Tourism and Transition. Government, Development and Economy*. Wallingford: CABI Publishing.
- Selwyn, Tom (ed) (1996) *The Tourist Image: Myths and Myth Making in*

Tourism. London: John Wiley & Son.

Viken, Arvid (1998) in Johnston, E. Margaret Twynam, G. David and Haider, Wolfgang (1998) Shaping tomorrow's north: the role of tourism and recreation.

Thunder Bay: Lakehead University.

Walsh, Kevin (1992/97) The Representation of the Past: Museums and Heritage in the Post-modern World. New York: Routledge.

Wang, Ning (2000) Tourism and Modernity. A Sociological Analysis.

Amsterdam: Pergamon

Young, James E. (1988) Writing and Rewriting the Holocaust. Narrative and the Consequences of Interpretation. Bloomington: Indiana University Press

<http://www.cbtkyrgyzstan.kg>

<http://www.helvetas.kg>

<http://www.world-tourism.org>

<http://www.community-tourism.org>

SUBMITTED BY: FLORENCIA ENGHEL

2006-12-04



© GLOCAL TIMES 2005
FLORENGHEL(AT)GMAIL.COM
ISSN 1654-7985